

Proceeding Paper

Photoelectrocatalytic Degradation of C.I. Basic Blue 9 in Water under UV and Visible Light Illumination Using Copper/Sulfur Co-Doped Titanium Dioxide Nanotubes ⁺

Edgar Clyde R. Lopez

Chemical Engineering Department, Adamson University, 900 San Marcelino St., Ermita, Manila, Philippines; edgarclydelopez09@gmail.com

+ Presented at the 2nd International Electronic Conference on Processes: Process Engineering—Current State and Future Trends (ECP 2023), 17–31 May 2023; Available online: https://ecp2023.sciforum.net/.

Abstract: Titanium dioxide has long been investigated for its excellent photocatalytic activity under UV illumination. However, its sluggish activity under visible light illumination remains a challenge. Doping titanium dioxide with transition metals and non-metals was done in the past to improve its catalytic properties, yet the expensive synthesis protocols involved in doping titanium dioxide limit its applications. Herein, a one-pot approach of doping titanium dioxide nanotubes was used. In particular, the Cu/S-TiNTs electrode was synthesized by electrochemical anodization using an electrolyte solution spike with CuSO4. The resulting nanostructured Cu/S-TiNTs electrode was used as a photoanode for the photoelectrocatalytic degradation of synthetic dye solution (50 ppm C.I. Basic Blue 9 in deionized water) in a 125-mL reactor. The Cu/S-TiNTs were shown to be catalytically active under both ultraviolet and visible light. Co-doping pristine TiNTs with copper and sulfur significantly enhanced the photoelectrocatalytic degradation rates of BB 9. Cu/S-TiNTs achieved 67% faster degradation rate ($k_1 = 1.5054 \pm 0.0193 \times 10^{-2} \text{ min}^{-1}$) compared to pristine TiNTs ($k_1 = 8.9106 \pm 0.0647$ × 10⁻³ min⁻¹) under visible light illumination. At the end of 60 min, the Cu/S-TiNTs were able to degrade 59.69% of the initial dye concentration under visible light compared to 45.43% degradation using pristine TiNTs. The synthesized photoanodes demonstrated good reusability and stability after several cycles of use, even at a low dopant loading. These findings bring us closer to the possible large-scale adaptation of advanced oxidation processes, such as photoelectrocatalysis, for environmental remediation of recalcitrant organic compounds in wastewater.

Keywords: photoelectrocatalysis; methylene blue; titanium dioxide; doping; wastewater

Citation: Lopez, E.C.R.

Photoelectrocatalytic Degradation of C.I. Basic Blue 9 in Water under UV and Visible Light Illumination Using Copper/Sulfur Co-Doped Titanium Dioxide Nanotubes. *Eng. Proc.* **2023**, *37*, x. https://doi.org/10.3390/xxxxx Published: 17 May 2023



Copyright: © 2023 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https://creativecommons.org/license s/by/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Titanium dioxide, a widely-available metal oxide semiconductor, has been used by many researchers for a variety of applications since the first reports of Fujishima and Honda [1] on UV-induced chemical reactions on its surface. Among its common uses is photocatalytic degradation of organics in water [2,3] and photoelectrochemical water splitting [4,5], among others.

Despite the extensive use of titanium dioxide in literature, commercial applications are minimal due to various key challenges that remain unaddressed to be feasible for large-scale use. Among these issues [6], enabling visible-light photoactivity and minimizing electron-hole recombination remains a challenge.

Doping titanium dioxide is the most popular method to address extend its photoactivity to the visible-light region. Cationic doping is more widely-studied; common cationic dopants are noble metals [7,8], transition metals [9,10], and rare earth metals [11,12]. First-principles calculations involving transition metal-doped TiO₂ previously showed



that transition metals introduce intermediated energy levels (IELs) that are previously absent in pristine TiO₂ due to the delocalization of 3d or 4d states of the transition metals and sometimes the hybridization of these states with the Ti 3d and O 2p states. This alters its electronic structure and improves its visible light absorption ability by narrowing the bandgap [13,14]. On the other hand, anionic dopants such as nitrogen [15], sulfur [16], and carbon [17] were also used to enhance visible-light photocatalysis by extending the optical absorption edge of TiO₂. Because anions are less electronegative than O, substitutionaldoping causes the anionic *p*-states to be pushed up out of the TiO₂ valence band into the bandgap [6].

Despite the effectiveness of doping in improving the visible-light photoactivity of TiO_2 , many issues still limit its application in water treatment. For example, cationic doping causes induced thermal instability which causes activity loss during calcination. Transition metals can also enhance electron-hole recombination by acting as electron traps which significantly reduces the photocatalytic activity of TiO_2 [18]. In the case of anionic doping, calcination could lead to reduced dopant concentration due to sintering [19]. To address these issues, co-doping TiO_2 with two or more elements has been explored by some researchers [20,21].

Meanwhile, even though co-doping TiO₂ can potentially improve its visible-light activity through bandgap modification, electron-hole recombination is still an issue. Efforts to address exciton and charge transfer issues, particularly electron-hole recombination upon photo-activation by a light source, have been limited. The most promising method to address charge transfer issues is to introduce an external bias such that the photogenerated electrons can be continuously harvested through an external circuit towards the counter-electrode, thus arresting the recombination of photogenerated electrons and holes. This process, known as photoelectrocatalysis (PEC), belong to advanced oxidation processes (AOPs) that has the potential to overcome electron-hole recombination experienced in conventional photocatalysis [22]. Preventing electron-hole recombination could enhance the production of reactive free radicals which can be exploited for various catalytic applications such as the degradation of organic pollutants in water [23,24], among others.

Herein, we explored the use of copper and sulfur co-doped titanium dioxide nanotubes (Cu/S-TiNTs) as photoelectrodes for photoelectrocatalytic degradation of textile dyes. In-situ doping was done to synthesize the Cu/S-TiNTs through double-anodization of Ti sheets with the dopant precursor dissolved in the electrolyte solution. The Cu/S-TiNTs were and then used for the batch degradation of C.I. Basic Blue 9 (BB 9). The catalytic performance of the synthesized nanotubes over repeated cycles of use was also investigated.

2. Materials and Methods

2.1. Materials

Titanium sheets (99.58% Ti, ASTM B265) were used as metal substrates for the synthesis of pristine TiNTs and Cu/S-TiNTs. Ethanol (≥99.5% CH₃CH₂OH), nitric acid (70% max. HNO₃), hydrochloric acid (37% max. HCl), copper sulfate pentahydrate (≥98.0%, CuSO₄·5H₂O), C.I. Basic Blue 9 (≥95% C₁₆H₁₈ClN₃S₃H₂O), and anhydrous sodium sulfate (≥95% Na₂SO₄) were obtained from Ajax Finechem Ltd. (Taren Point, Australia). Acetone (≥99.5% CH₃CH₂COOH) was purchased from RCI Labscan Ltd. (Bangkok, Thailand). Meanwhile, ammonium fluoride (≥98.0% NH₄F) and platinum wire (≥99.99% Pt, 0.1 mm diameter) were obtained from Sigma-Aldrich (St. Louis, MO, USA). All chemicals are of analytical grade and are used as-received without purification. All preparations were done using ultrapure water (Milli-Q, ≤18.2 MΩ·cm at 25 °C, Merck, Rahway, NJ, USA).

2.2. Synthesis of Pristine (TiNTs) and Copper/Sulfur Co-Doped (Cu/S-TiNTs) Titanium Dioxide Nanotus

Briefly, titanium sheets ($20 \times 50 \times 0.1$ mm) were sonicated in ethanol, acetone, and ultrapure water at 35 °C, 15 min in each solvent, to remove the impurities on its surface. The pre-treated Ti sheets were etched in freshly-prepared aqua regia for 3 min to dissolve any adhering oxide layer [25]. The etched Ti sheets were washed using free-flowing ultrapure water and then oven-dried prior to use.

Pristine TiNTs were synthesized by anodizing the treated Ti sheets at 30.0 V for 60 min at 20 °C using a Pt wire as the counter electrode. The anodization electrolyte consists of 0.3 wt% NH₄F and 2 vol% ultrapure water dissolved in ethylene glycol as solvent. Meanwhile, Cu/S-TiNTs were synthesized using the same anodization recipe, but a sufficient amount of CuSO₄ was added to the anodization electrolyte to make a 1.0 wt.% CuSO₄ solution which served as a precursor to achieving in-situ Cu/S co-doping. The as-anodized Ti sheets were sonicated in ethanol for 2 min at 30 °C, washed with ultrapure water, and then oven-dried to remove the TiO₂ barrier layer and expose the nanoporous template where ordered TiO₂ nanotubes can grow. The sonicated samples were anodized using the same anodization recipe for another 60 min. The double-anodized TiNTs were washed in ultrapure water, oven-dried, and then calcined in a muffle furnace (Constance FN-1208) at 450 °C for 3 h at a 10 °C/min heating and cooling ramp. The calcined pristine TiNTs and Cu/S-TiNTs were stored in a desiccator prior to characterization and degradation experiments.

2.3. Textile Dye Degradation in a Batch Photoelectrochemical Reactor

The photoelectrocatalytic activity of pristine TiNTs and Cu/S-TiNTs in degrading C.I. Basic Blue 9 (BB 9) was investigated in a batch, agitated, and borosilicate-made photoelectrochemical reactor with a total working volume of 125 mL and housed in an air-cooled black box. Four pieces of 40 W low-pressure mercury lamp (λ_{max} = 365 nm) in series with a total average UV intensity of 2000 μ W cm⁻² were used for UV-assisted experiments. Meanwhile, a halogen lamp with an average intensity of 10,000 lumens was used to simulate solar-assisted photoelectrocatalysis. Meanwhile, a benchtop DC power supply (V_{max} = 60.0 V, I_{max} = 5.0 A, Top Power Ltd., Singapore) was used as an electrical source and was operated at a constant current density of 0.5 mA cm⁻².

Synthetic dye solutions of BB 9 with an initial concentration of 50.0 mg L⁻¹ were prepared, and a sufficient amount of anhydrous Na₂SO₄ was dissolved in the dye solution to achieve a 0.100 M Na₂SO₄ concentration. The resulting solution was used without pH adjustment. Prior to all degradation experiments, the working solution is well-stirred in the dark for 60 min to compensate for the adsorption of BB 9 on the surface of the photoelectrodes. The working solution is maintained at 30 °C using a cold-water bath. After 60 min, the light source and DC source were turned on, and aliquots were obtained at 5-min intervals for 60 min. The aliquots were immediately analyzed for their optical absorbance spectra using a Vis-NIR spectrophotometer (Go-Direct SpectroVis Plus, Vernier, Beaverton, OR, USA). The concentration profiles were fitted using a pseudo-first-order (PFO) kinetic model in their integrated form. All experimental runs were done in triplicates, and three absorbance readings were done for each replicate.

3. Results

3.1. Photoelectrocatalytic Degradation under Ultraviolet Light

Batch photoelectrocatalysis was performed on C.I. Basic Blue 9 (BB 9) in aqueous solutions using pristine TiNTs and Cu/S-TiNTs as photoanodes, respectively, to compare their photoelectrocatalytic degradation performance. The UV intensity and applied potential were fixed at 2000 μ W cm⁻² and 1 mA cm⁻², respectively, and the concentration profiles were fitted numerically to the pseudo-first-order (PFO) kinetic model in accordance with the commonly observed degradation model for AOPs [26]. As shown in Figure 1, the Cu/S-TiNTs performed better in degrading BB 9 degradation under UV light illumination. BB 9 degraded over 36% faster using Cu/S-TiNTs ($k_1 = 10.5353 \pm 0.2001 \times 10^{-3} \text{ min}^{-1}$) compared to pristine TiNTs ($k_1 = 7.7367 \pm 0.2110 \times 10^{-3} \text{ min}^{-1}$). At the end of 60 min, the Cu/S-TiNTs were able to degrade 49.36% of the initial BB 9 concentration. Meanwhile, under similar experimental conditions, 35.94% of the initial BB 9 degraded using pristine TiNTs as photoelectrodes. These results show that co-doping pristine TiNTs with copper and sulfur improves its PEC performance in degrading textile dyes significantly under UV light illumination. The PEC activity of the pristine TiNTs and Cu/S-TiNTs were also tested upon repeated electrode use. As the number of electrode use increases, the PEC activity of the photoelectrodes also dropped, which can be due to the fouling of the photoelectrodes and/or leaching of dopants into the solution during photoelectrocatalysis. Further studies can be done to improve the catalytic activity of the photoelectrodes for repeated use. Nonetheless, in this study, we demonstrated that Cu-S/TiNTs remained superior in terms of its PEC activity under UV light illumination compared to pristine TiNTs even after several cycles of reuse.

3.2. Photoelectrocatalytic Degradation under Visible Light

To determine the role of Cu/S co-doping on the PEC performance of the TiNTs, visible light-assisted photoelectrocatalytic degradation of BB 9 were performed in a batch PEC reactor at a fixed visible light intensity and applied current density. Cu/S co-doping enhanced the PEC activity of pristine TiNTs in degrading BB 9 as evidenced by a faster degradation rate observed using Cu/S-TiNTs compared to pristine TiNTs. Under visible light illumination, the Cu/S-TiNTs achieved 67% faster degradation rate ($k_1 = 1.5054 \pm 0.0193 \times$ 10^{-2} min⁻¹) compared to pristine TiNTs (k₁ = 8.9106 ± 0.0647 × 10⁻³ min⁻¹). At the end of 60 min, the Cu/S-TiNTs was able to degrade 59.69% of the initial BB 9 concentration compared to 45.43% degradation of the initial BB 9 using pristine TiNTs under similar experimental conditions. These results show that Cu/S co-doping in pristine TiNTs enhanced its PEC performance in the visible light range, which is important to make solar-assisted PEC possible. As in the case of UV-assisted PEC, the catalytic activity of the photoelectrodes decreased as the number of cycles of use increases. Even so, we were able to demonstrate that the Cu/S-TiNTs synthesized by a simple in-situ doping anodization technique is catalytically-active under both UV light and visible light region of the solar spectrum and achieved an enhanced activity in degrading conventional textile dyes compared to pristine TiNTs alone.

In general, the use of Cu/S-TiNTs as photoelectrodes for the degradation of textile dyes have several key advantages compared to the use of traditional TiO2 nanopowders. First, the nanotubular structure of Cu/S-TiNTs allows fast carrier transport, which reduces losses due to electron-hole recombination at recombination centers [27]. Second, the use of nanostructured TiNTs as photoelectrode allows higher absorption of incident photons from the UV light source compared to using a flat TiO₂ film [28]. Third, the nanotubular geometry results in a very high surface area and avoids catalyst aggregation experienced in TiO₂ nanoparticles, which leads to an increase in reactivity and specific reaction rates [27]. Fourth, doping with transition metals, copper/sulfur, in this case, creates an electrontrap which prevents electron-hole recombination [29]. Fifth, the increased charge-mobility during PEC as a result of the applied electrical potential allows continuous harvesting of photogenerated-electrons from the photoanode to the counter-electrode, which, in turn, prevents recombination [30]. The combination of all these factors allows the photo-generated electron-holes to have longer lifespans, which, in turn, leads to the increased production of hydroxyl free radicals which are very reactive towards the degradation of organics. Significant enhancement in the PEC activity of pristine TiNTs was demonstrated in our case even at low Cu/S-loading. This is important in reducing the overall cost of the material for PEC applications.

4. Conclusions

Copper and sulfur were successfully co-doped in titanium dioxide nanotubes with a highly-ordered surface morphology in a one-pot approach. The Cu/S-TiNTs were shown to be catalytically active in degrading conventional textile dyes such as C.I. Basic Blue 9 under both ultraviolet and visible light photoelectrocatalysis. Co-doping pristine TiNTs significantly improved the degradation rate of the model dye even at a low dopant loading. Most importantly, it remained catalytically-active in degrading textile dyes even after several usages, showing its excellent reusability. This makes Cu/S-TiNTs a promising material for the photoelectrocatalytic degradation of recalcitrant organic compounds in wastewater.

Author Contributions: Conceptualization, E.C.R.L.; methodology, E.C.R.L.; software, E.C.R.L.; validation, E.C.R.L.; formal analysis, E.C.R.L.; investigation, E.C.R.L.; resources, E.C.R.L.; data curation, E.C.R.L.; writing—original draft preparation, E.C.R.L.; writing—review and editing, E.C.R.L.; visualization, E.C.R.L.; supervision, E.C.R.L.; project administration, E.C.R.L.; funding acquisition, E.C.R.L. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement: Not applicable.

Data Availability Statement: Not applicable.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- 1. Akira, F.; Kenichi, H. Electrochemical Photolysis of Water at a Semiconductor Electrode. *Nature* 1972, 238, 37.
- Suhadolnik, L.; Pohar, A.; Novak, U.; Likozar, B.; Mihelič, A.; Čeh, M. Continuous photocatalytic, electrocatalytic and photoelectrocatalytic degradation of a reactive textile dye for wastewater-treatment processes: Batch, microreactor and scaled-up operation. J. Ind. Eng. Chem. 2019, 72, 178–188. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jiec.2018.12.017.
- Karlsson, M.C.F.; Abbas, Z.; Bordes, R.; Cao, Y.; Larsson, A.; Taylor, P.; Steenari, B.M. Characterisation of silicon, zirconium and aluminium coated titanium dioxide pigments recovered from paint waste. *Dye. Pigment.* 2019, 162, 145–152. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dyepig.2018.06.028.
- Mahmoud, M.S.; Ahmed, E.; Farghali, A.A.; Zaki, A.H.; Abdelghani, E.A.M.; Barakat, N.A.M. Influence of Mn, Cu, and Cddoping for titanium oxide nanotubes on the photocatalytic activity toward water splitting under visible light irradiation. *Colloids Surf. A Physicochem. Eng. Asp.* 2018, 554, 100–109. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colsurfa.2018.06.039.
- Krysiak, O.A.; Barczuk, P.J.; Bienkowski, K.; Wojciechowski, T.; Augustynski, J. The photocatalytic activity of rutile and anatase TiO₂ electrodes modified with plasmonic metal nanoparticles followed by photoelectrochemical measurements. *Catal. Today* 2019, 321–322, 52–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2018.01.007.
- 6. Henderson, M.A. A surface science perspective on TiO₂ photocatalysis. *Surf. Sci. Rep.* **2011**, *66*, 185–297. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.surfrep.2011.01.001.
- Nguyen, C.H.; Juang, R.S. Efficient removal of cationic dyes from water by a combined adsorption-photocatalysis process using platinum-doped titanate nanomaterials. J. Taiwan Inst. Chem. Eng. 2019, 99, 166–179. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtice.2019.03.017.
- Merenda, A.; Weber, M.; Bechelany, M.; Allioux, F.M.; Hyde, L.; Kong, L.; Dumée, L.F. Fabrication of Pd-TiO₂ nanotube photoactive junctions via Atomic Layer Deposition for persistent pesticide pollutants degradation. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 2019, 483, 219–230. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsusc.2019.03.285.
- Lin, J.C.T.; Sopajaree, K.; Jitjanesuwan, T.; Lu, M.C. Application of visible light on copper-doped titanium dioxide catalyzing degradation of chlorophenols. *Sep. Purif. Technol.* 2018, 191, 233–243. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seppur.2017.09.027.
- Nguyen, H.H.; Gyawali, G.; Hoon, J.S.; Sekino, T.; Lee, S.W. Cr-doped TiO₂ nanotubes with a double-layer model: An effective way to improve the efficiency of dye-sensitized solar cells. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 2018, 458, 523–528. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ap-susc.2018.07.117.
- Meksi, M.; Kochkar, H.; Berhault, G.; Guillard, C. Effect of cerium content and post-thermal treatment on doped anisotropic TiO₂ nanomaterials and kinetic study of the photodegradation of formic acid. J. Mol. Catal. A Chem. 2015, 409, 162–170. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.molcata.2015.08.024.
- Reli, M.; Ambrožová, N.; Šihor, M.; Matějová, L.; Čapek, L.; Obalová, L.; Matěj, Z.; Kotarba, A.; Kočí, K. Novel cerium doped titania catalysts for photocatalytic decomposition of ammonia. *Appl. Catal. B* 2015, *178*, 108–116. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apcatb.2014.10.021.

- 13. Liu, X.; Li, Y.; Wei, Z.; Shi, L. A Fundamental DFT Study of Anatase (TiO₂) Doped with 3d Transition Metals for High Photocatalytic Activities. *J. Wuhan Univ. Technol. Mater. Sci. Ed.* **2018**, *33*, 403–408. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11595-018-1836-5.
- 14. Xie, K.; Jia, Q.; Wang, Y.; Zhang, W.; Xu, J. The electronic structure and optical properties of Anatase TiO₂ with rare earth metal dopants from first-principles calculations. *Materials* **2018**, *11*, 179. https://doi.org/10.3390/ma11020179.
- 15. Peighambardoust, N.S.; Asl, S.K.; Mohammadpour, R.; Asl, S.K. Band-gap narrowing and electrochemical properties in Ndoped and reduced anodic TiO₂ nanotube arrays. *Electrochim. Acta* **2018**, 270, 245–255. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.electacta.2018.03.091.
- Mahmoud, M.S.; Akhtar, M.S.; Mohamed, I.M.A.; Hamdan, R.; Dakka, Y.A.; Barakat, N.A.M. Demonstrated photons to electron activity of S-doped TiO₂ nanofibers as photoanode in the DSSC. *Mater. Lett.* 2018, 225, 77–81. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matlet.2018.04.108.
- Cinelli, G.; Cuomo, F.; Ambrosone, L.; Colella, M.; Ceglie, A.; Venditti, F.; Lopez, F. Photocatalytic degradation of a model textile dye using Carbon-doped titanium dioxide and visible light. *J. Water Process Eng.* 2017, 20, 71–77. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jwpe.2017.09.014.
- Daghrir, R.; Drogui, P.; Robert, D. Modified TiO₂ for environmental photocatalytic applications: A review. *Ind. Eng. Chem. Res.* 2013, 52, 3581–3599. https://doi.org/10.1021/ie303468t.
- 19. DiPaola, A.; Marcì, G.; Ikeda, S.; Ohtani, B.; Palmisano, L. Transition metal doped TiO₂: Physical properties and photocatalytic behavior. *Int. J. Photoenergy* **2001**, *3*, 171–176.
- Chauhan, N.; Singh, V.; Kumar, S.; Kumari, M.; Sirohi, K. Synthesis of nitrogen & palladium co-doped mesoporous titanium dioxide nanoparticles via evaporation induced self assembly method and study of their photocatalytic properties. *J. Mol. Struct.* 2019, 1185, 219–228. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.molstruc.2019.02.055.
- Ratso, S.; Käärik, M.; Kook, M.; Paiste, P.; Aruväli, J.; Vlassov, S.; Kisand, V.; Leis, J.; Kannan, A.M.; Tammeveski, K. High performance catalysts based on Fe/N co-doped carbide-derived carbon and carbon nanotube composites for oxygen reduction reaction in acid media. *Int. J. Hydrog. Energy* 2019, 44, 12636–12648. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhydene.2018.11.080.
- 22. Garcia-Segura, S.; Brillas, E. Applied photoelectrocatalysis on the degradation of organic pollutants in wastewaters. J. Photochem. Photobiol. C Photochem. Rev. 2017, 31, 1–35. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jphotochemrev.2017.01.005.
- da Rosa, A.P.P.; Cavalcante, R.P.; da Silva, D.A.; da Silva, L.d.M.; da Silva, T.F.; Gozzi, F.; McGlynn, E.; Brady-Boyd, A.; Casagrande, G.A.; Wender, H.; et al. H₂O₂-assisted photoelectrocatalytic degradation of Mitoxantrone using CuO nanostructured films: Identification of by-products and toxicity. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2019, 651, 2845–2856. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.10.173.
- Mazierski, P.; Borzyszkowska, A.F.; Wilczewska, P.; Białk-Bielińska, A.; Zaleska-Medynska, A.; Siedlecka, E.M.; Pieczyńska, A. Removal of 5-fluorouracil by solar-driven photoelectrocatalytic oxidation using Ti/TiO₂(NT) photoelectrodes. *Water Res.* 2019, 157, 610–620. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2019.04.010.
- 25. Cottineau, T.; Béalu, N.; Gross, P.A.; Pronkin, S.N.; Keller, N.; Savinova, E.R.; Keller, V. One step synthesis of niobium doped titania nanotube arrays to form (N,Nb) co-doped TiO₂ with high visible light photoelectrochemical activity. *J. Mater. Chem. A Mater.* **2013**, *1*, 2151–2160. https://doi.org/10.1039/c2ta00922f.
- 26. Liu, B.; Zhao, X.; Terashima, C.; Fujishima, A.; Nakata, K. Thermodynamic and kinetic analysis of heterogeneous photocatalysis for semiconductor systems. *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.* **2014**, *16*, 8751–8760. https://doi.org/10.1039/c3cp55317e.
- 27. Roy, P.; Berger, S.; Schmuki, P. TiO₂ nanotubes: Synthesis and applications. *Angew. Chem.-Int. Ed.* 2011, 50, 2904–2939. https://doi.org/10.1002/anie.201001374.
- 28. Hoseinzadeh, T.; Ghorannevis, Z.; Ghoranneviss, M.; Sari, A.H.; Salem, M.K. Effects of various applied voltages on physical properties of TiO₂ nanotubes by anodization method. *J. Theor. Appl. Phys.* **2017**, *11*, 243–248. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40094-017-0257-9.
- Kment, S.; Kmentova, H.; Kluson, P.; Krysa, J.; Hubicka, Z.; Cirkva, V.; Gregora, I.; Solcova, O.; Jastrabik, L. Notes on the photoinduced characteristics of transition metal-doped and undoped titanium dioxide thin films. *J. Colloid Interface Sci.* 2010, 348, 198– 205. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2010.04.002.
- 30. Cao, D.; Wang, Y.; Zhao, X. Combination of photocatalytic and electrochemical degradation of organic pollutants from water. *Curr. Opin. Green Sustain. Chem.* **2017**, *6*, 78–84. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cogsc.2017.05.007.

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.